

Lesson 10:

Balancing human rights

Overview

To start to appreciate how people's human rights can conflict and why they need to be limited, students review a legal case between Naomi Campbell and the Mirror. They learn that most human rights can be limited but some are absolute, and then take on the role of Head Teacher to review a number of scenarios and decide if human rights should be limited or not. They finish by discussing the limits of different human rights.

Starter

Activity 1 (5mins): Conflict (Slides 3-7)

Students explore what is meant by conflict by considering how a disagreement between two friends could be resolved. Using the example on the slides, they observe how one person's opinion is compromised to resolve the situation. Explain that in the same way opinions conflict, so can human rights, which is why they need to be limited or restricted in certain circumstances.

Main

Activity 2 (15-20mins): Real-life conflict (Slides 8-14)

Use the slides to explain that most human rights can be limited but some are absolute. Develop students' understanding of how human rights can conflict, by getting them to examine a real-life case study where the rights of a celebrity, Naomi Campbell, conflict with the rights of a newspaper. Hand out worksheet 38 and get students to work in pairs to complete the questions. They may need the human rights cards on worksheet 32 to identify which rights are conflicting. Discuss their thoughts and reveal the conflicting rights on the slide.

Activity 3 (15-20mins): Head Teacher (Slides 15-18)

In the same pairs, students work in the role of Head Teacher. Discuss the responsibilities and qualities of a Head Teacher to help them get into the role. They review a number of scenarios on worksheet 39 and have to decide whether the students' human rights should be limited or not. They then group with another pair and compare answers. Discuss as a class.

Activity 4 (15mins): What are the limits? (Slides 19-29)

In pairs, students consider the limits of freedom of expression (Article 10) by reviewing different statements and discussing whether the opinions should be limited or not. Hand out worksheet 40 for them to use to form their points of view. Discuss as a class. Now consider whether the absolute right not to be tortured (Article 3) should ever be limited or not. Discuss the scenario on the slides and the two opposing points of view.

Plenary

Activity 5 (5mins): Questions (Slide 30)

Students write down two questions they would like to ask the rest of the class. Go around the class nominating some students to ask their questions and giving their peers the opportunity to try and answer the questions.

Learning objectives

- ▶ Understand that some human rights can be limited and restricted.
- ▶ Understand that some human rights are absolute.
- ▶ Understand that human rights need to be balanced to protect individuals and wider society.

Subject links

- ▶ Citizenship
- ▶ PSHEE
- ▶ English
- ▶ Drama

Resources

- ▶ Slides: Lesson 10
- ▶ Worksheets:
- ▶ 38 - Real-life conflict
- ▶ 39 - Limiting human rights
- ▶ 40 - What are the limits?
- ▶ 32 - Human rights cards

Lesson 10:

Balancing human rights

Support notes

Extension/homework/extra activity ideas

Use these ideas as inspiration for alternative, differentiation or homework activities, or to develop learning in other subjects or lessons.

Extension 1: Debate extra powers

You could explore the Government plans to increase teachers' power to put students in same-day detention and to search students. You could discuss whether they think it is fair or unfair to limit a student's rights in this way. Get them to work in role of student and Head Teacher to consider both points of view.

Extension 2: Conflicting human rights

Refer to the balancing human rights case studies in the useful information section of Equal Rights, Equal Respect and get students to identify which human rights are conflicting. Who has responsibility for protecting their human rights? Debate how they should be balanced.

Extension 3: Human rights debate

Acknowledge that human rights are complex and people don't always agree with all the principles or decisions that are made by the courts. Get students debating topical human rights arguments:

- ▶ An illegal immigrant who is also a criminal is allowed to stay in Britain because their sexuality meant they would be tortured in their own country (Prohibition of torture - Article 3 of the European Convention on Human Rights).
- ▶ Prisoners being given the right to vote (Right to free elections - Article 3 of Protocol 1 of the European Convention on Human Rights).
- ▶ Mosquito devices which are high pitched sounds that only babies and children can hear and are used to prevent young people congregating outside shops (Freedom of assembly and association - Article 11 of the European Convention on Human Rights). Further information and an activity on this can be found in lesson 6 of the Right Here, Right Now (produced by the Ministry of Justice) resources: http://www.amnesty.org.uk/uploads/documents/doc_20104.pdf
- ▶ Teachers have extra powers to search students (Right to respect for private and family life - Article 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights).

Extension 4: Myth-busting

Refer to the myth-busting case studies in the useful information section of the website: www.equalityhumanrights.com/equalrightsequalrespect/usefulinformation. Present the news extracts and ask students what image of human rights they portray? Explain how the articles are inaccurate and highlight that the media can portray a negative image of human rights which often comes from a lack of understanding. Discuss the issues with reporting inaccurate news.

Useful links/further information

Visit the useful information section of Equal Rights, Equal Respect to access this information:

www.equalityhumanrights.com/equalrightsequalrespect/usefulinformation:

- ▶ **Human rights case studies**- selection of human rights case studies.
- ▶ **Understanding human rights** - background information to human rights.
- ▶ **Useful links**- useful links to further information and resources on human rights.
- ▶ **Glossary** - glossary of key words.

Visit the training section of Equal Rights, Equal Respect to access this information:

www.equalityhumanrights.com/equalrightsequalrespect/training

- ▶ **Equality and human rights training video** - training to develop knowledge of human rights.

Other useful link:

- ▶ **Ministry of Justice Human Rights Act Guidance** - <http://www.justice.gov.uk/guidance/freedom-and-rights/human-rights.htm>

Lesson 10:

Balancing human rights

Prior learning

- ▶ Understanding of what human rights are and how they work (Lessons 8-9).

Differentiation ideas

- ▶ Mixed ability pairs are required for activities 2-4.

Preparation and planning

- ▶ Review the PowerPoint slides and tailor them to suit your teaching and class ability.
- ▶ In advance, it will be beneficial to read the background to human rights. See further information on the previous page.
- ▶ Photocopy enough copies of all the worksheets for students.